

Raymond J. Kelleher III<sup>a,b</sup> and Jie Shen<sup>b,c,1</sup>

Mutations in the PSEN1 gene, encoding presenilin-1 (PS1), are the most common cause of familial Alzheimer's disease (FAD). PS1 functions as the catalytic subunit of  $\gamma$ -secretase, an intramembranous protease that cleaves a variety of type 1 transmembrane proteins, notably including the amyloid precursor protein (APP) and Notch. Following prior cleavage by β-secretase, processing of APP by  $\gamma$ -secretase generates  $\beta$ -amyloid (Aβ) peptides of varying lengths. Whereas Aβ40 accounts for ~90% of A $\beta$  production, the minor A $\beta$ 42 product is more hydrophobic and is thought to nucleate Aβ aggregation, leading to amyloid plaque deposition in the AD brain. In PNAS, Sun et al. (1) used an in vitro system to evaluate the effects of 138 pathogenic mutations in PSEN1 on the production of Aβ40 and Aβ42, and their findings provide valuable perspectives on pathogenic mechanisms in AD. The authors' systematic analysis of mutations affecting all PS1 residues altered in FAD provides an unprecedented perspective on the impact of PSEN1 mutations on Aß production and  $\gamma$ -secretase activity.

The mechanism by which *PSEN1* mutations lead to neurodegeneration and dementia in FAD remains hotly debated. Two distinct but not mutually exclusive hypotheses have been proposed to explain how PSEN1 mutations cause FAD (2, 3). The amyloid hypothesis proposed that PSEN1 mutations initiate disease pathogenesis by increasing production of A $\beta$ 42 (2). This view was based on initial studies in which small numbers of clinical PSEN1 mutations were found to increase levels of Aβ42 in plasma of FAD patients, transfected cells, and transgenic mice, leading to the notion that PSEN1 mutations triggered FAD pathogenesis by enhancing APP processing and inducing excessive production of Aβ42 (2, 4-6). As inconsistencies with this model subsequently emerged, revision of the amyloid hypothesis shifted the focus to relative rather than absolute increases in A $\beta$ 42 production, and the ability to increase the A $\beta$ 42/A $\beta$ 40 ratio has been widely considered an essential and invariant property of PSEN1-bearing pathogenic mutations (7). The presenilin hypothesis offers an alternative view of disease pathogenesis, proposing that PSEN1 mutations cause a loss of essential presenilin functions in the brain, which in turn triggers neurodegeneration and dementia in FAD (3). This proposal was prompted by earlier genetic findings showing that presenilin is essential for learning and memory, as well as neuronal survival during aging in the adult mouse cerebral cortex (8-10), and was further supported by more recent reports demonstrating that PSEN1 mutations typically cause loss of PS1 function (11, 12) and that severe PSEN1 mutations abolished  $\gamma$ -secretase activities and A $\beta$  production in mouse brains (13, 14).

## Loss of γ-Secretase Activity by PSEN1 **Mutations**

In the new study by Sun et al. (1), the authors leverage their expertise in purification and structural analysis of  $\gamma$ -secretase to perform a systematic analysis of the impact of the full spectrum of clinical PSEN1 mutations on Aβ production. In an impressive tour de force, the authors purified  $\gamma$ -secretase complexes containing each of the 138 distinct FAD-causing mutations to homogeneity, and then analyzed the effects of these mutations on generation of A<sub>β40</sub> and A<sub>β42</sub> from an APP-derived substrate using an established in vitro assay system. These 138 mutations represent each of the 121 PS1 residues affected by FAD-causing mutations, including several examples of residues targeted by multiple mutations in FAD. Remarkably, 90% of the analyzed mutations impaired  $\gamma$ -secretase-dependent APP processing, as reflected by decreased production of Aβ40 and A<sup>β</sup>42. Still more strikingly, detectable production of A<sub>β40</sub> and A<sub>β42</sub> was fully abolished by 30% (42 of 138) of the mutations tested, including the previously characterized functionally null mutations L435F and C410Y (13, 14). Contrary to the view that increased A $\beta$ 42 production is an essential feature of pathogenic PSEN1 mutations (2), 75% (104 of 138) of the mutations analyzed decreased production of both Aβ42 and A $\beta$ 40 (1). Among these 104 mutations, 67 mutations caused severe reduction (greater than 95%) of Aβ40 production, whereas 14 mutations resulted in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup>Department of Neurology, Center for Human Genetic Research, Massachusetts General Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA 02114; <sup>b</sup>Program in Neuroscience, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA 02115; and <sup>c</sup>Department of Neurology, Brigham & Women's Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA 02115

Author contributions: R.J.K. and J.S. wrote the paper.

Conflict of interest statement: J.S. is a member of the Scientific Advisory Board of Simcere Pharmaceutical Co.

See companion article on page E476.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: jshen@rics.bwh.harvard.edu.

severe reduction of A $\beta$ 42 production. These results demonstrate conclusively that pathogenic *PSEN1* mutations characteristically suppress rather than enhance  $\gamma$ -secretase activity and A $\beta$  production, with a sizable proportion of mutations severely impairing these functions.

Notably, analysis of the purified  $\gamma$ -secretase complexes indicated that pathogenic mutations do not interfere with stable PS1 expression or  $\gamma$ -secretase complex assembly, suggesting that mutations primarily affect the catalytic activity of  $\gamma$ -secretase. Although there was no obvious pattern of correlation between the severity of a mutation's effect on  $A\beta$  production and its position in the primary protein structure, future studies mapping pathogenic PSEN1 mutations to secondary and tertiary structural domains may reveal important structure-function relationships. As a first step in this direction, Sun et al. (1) found that many of the PSEN1 mutations that severely compromised  $\gamma$ -secretase activity (including L435F and C410Y) affect residues that map near the active site in their recently reported 3D structure of the complex (1, 15), consistent with direct "orthosteric" effects of these mutations on catalytic function. The remaining mutations that do not map near the active site but nevertheless severely impair  $A\beta$ production may interfere with functional interactions of PS1 with other  $\gamma$ -secretase subunits or with the APP substrate.

## Evidence Against an Increased Aβ42/Aβ40 Ratio as an Essential Pathogenic Feature in FAD

Surprisingly, Sun et al. (1) found that pathogenic PSEN1 mutations did not uniformly increase the Aβ42/Aβ40 ratio. Production of Aβ40 and Aβ42 was abolished by 42 mutations tested, precluding calculation of the Aβ42/Aβ40 ratio. Furthermore, 13 of the remaining 96 mutations decreased the Aβ42/Aβ40 ratio, whereas 83 mutations increased the Aβ42/Aβ40 ratio. These findings argue against the Aβ42/Aβ40 ratio as a key determinant of the pathogenicity of PSEN1 mutations, in contradiction with the central premise of the amyloid hypothesis. Sun et al. next examined the relationship between the  $A\beta 42/A\beta 40$  ratio and the age of disease onset associated with individual mutations and found no significant correlation, further arguing against the pathogenicity of a heightened Aβ42/Aβ40 ratio. However, it should be noted that age of onset is an imperfect proxy for the pathogenicity of individual mutations; for example, the age of onset ascribed to a given FAD mutation is often based on small numbers of affected individuals and can vary substantially based on APOE genotype and possibly other modifier effects (16, 17). In contrast, mean ages of onset derived from large numbers of mutations identified in PSEN1 and APP might offer insight into the relative pathogenicity of mutations in each gene; a recent meta-analysis of 1,300 individuals with PSEN or APP mutations demonstrated that PSEN1 mutations cause FAD with a significantly earlier mean age of onset than APP mutations (18).

It has been proposed that *PSEN1* mutations increase the A $\beta$ 42/ A $\beta$ 40 ratio by impeding the sequential cleavage of longer A $\beta$ peptides by  $\gamma$ -secretase, thereby enhancing relative production of A $\beta$ 42 (19). However, this model is incompatible with the frequent occurrence (~30%) of pathogenic mutations that completely abolish A $\beta$ 42 production. Rather, *PSEN1* mutations appear to elevate the A $\beta$ 42/A $\beta$ 40 ratio primarily by decreasing levels of A $\beta$ 40. For the mutations analyzed by Sun et al. (1), production of A $\beta$ 40 was typically decreased more than that of A $\beta$ 42, and complete loss of A $\beta$ 40 production precluded assessment of the ratio for ~30% of mutations. Recent studies in *Psen1* knockin mice demonstrated that heterozygosity for two such mutations, C410Y or L435F, markedly impairs overall A $\beta$  production but increases the A $\beta$ 42/A $\beta$ 40 ratio because of a greater reduction in A $\beta$ 40 than A $\beta$ 42 (13). An interesting implication of these findings is that the A $\beta$  deposited in the brains of FAD patients heterozygous

Sun et al. used an in vitro system to evaluate the effects of 138 pathogenic mutations in *PSEN1* on the production of A $\beta$ 40 and A $\beta$ 42, and their findings provide valuable perspectives on pathogenic mechanisms in AD.

for such functionally inactivating PSEN1 mutations is presumably produced by PS1 expressed from the normal PSEN1 allele. As these findings underscore, analysis of the functional impact of PSEN1 mutations in a heterozygous context (corresponding to the genotype of FAD patients) may provide a more complete picture of the operative pathogenic mechanisms. Indeed, the dominant inheritance, missense nature, and loss-of-function effects of pathogenic PSEN1 mutations are most consistent with a dominant-negative disease mechanism, and studies in cell culture have shown that mutant PS1 can exert dominant-negative effects on coexpressed wild-type PS1 (12). In addition, whereas the results of Sun et al. (1) reveal that age of FAD onset does not correlate with either relative or total A $\beta$  production, it would be informative to assess correlations of disease severity with other measures of PS1 function and  $\gamma$ -secretase activity as potential biomarkers. Notch processing activity represents one commonly used measure, but identification and assessment of physiological PS1 substrates that support neuronal survival in the adult brain will ultimately be important, because Notch mediates presenilin function in the developing but not the adult brain (20).

Efforts to develop disease-modifying therapies for AD have been heavily focused on the amyloid hypothesis, but repeated failures in late-stage clinical trials of experimental agents based on this hypothesis heighten the urgency to explore alternative disease mechanisms. The study by Sun et al. (1) provides the most comprehensive assessment to date of the impact of FAD mutations on  $\gamma$ -secretase activity and A $\beta$  production, and their results point to loss of  $\gamma$ -secretase activity as the primary molecular defect imposed by pathogenic *PSEN1* mutations. Thus, therapeutic strategies aimed at restoring  $\gamma$ -secretase activity offer a valid and complementary approach to develop diseasemodifying treatments for FAD.

## Acknowledgments

This work was supported by NIH Grants R01NS041783 and R01NS042818 (to J.S.) and R01NS075346 (to R.J.K.), and an award from the MetLife Foundation (to J.S.).

<sup>1</sup> Sun L, Zhou R, Yang G, Shi Y (2017) Analysis of 138 pathogenic mutations in presenilin-1 on the in vitro production of Aβ42 and Aβ40 peptides by γ-secretase. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 114:E476–E485.

<sup>2</sup> Hardy J, Selkoe DJ (2002) The amyloid hypothesis of Alzheimer's disease: Progress and problems on the road to therapeutics. Science 297(5580): 353–356.

- 3 Shen J, Kelleher RJ, 3rd (2007) The presenilin hypothesis of Alzheimer's disease: Evidence for a loss-of-function pathogenic mechanism. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104(2):403–409.
- 4 Duff K, et al. (1996) Increased amyloid-beta42(43) in brains of mice expressing mutant presenilin 1. Nature 383(6602):710-713.
- 5 Scheuner D, et al. (1996) Secreted amyloid beta-protein similar to that in the senile plaques of Alzheimer's disease is increased in vivo by the presenilin 1 and 2 and APP mutations linked to familial Alzheimer's disease. Nat Med 2(8):864–870.
- 6 Borchelt DR, et al. (1996) Familial Alzheimer's disease-linked presenilin 1 variants elevate Abeta1-42/1-40 ratio in vitro and in vivo. Neuron 17(5):1005–1013.
- 7 Selkoe DJ, Hardy J (2016) The amyloid hypothesis of Alzheimer's disease at 25 years. EMBO Mol Med 8(6):595–608.
- 8 Saura CA, et al. (2004) Loss of presenilin function causes impairments of memory and synaptic plasticity followed by age-dependent neurodegeneration. *Neuron* 42(1):23–36.
- 9 Wines-Samuelson M, et al. (2010) Characterization of age-dependent and progressive cortical neuronal degeneration in presenilin conditional mutant mice. *PLoS One* 5(4):e10195.
- 10 Watanabe H, Xia D, Kanekiyo T, Kelleher RJ, 3rd, Shen J (2012) Familial frontotemporal dementia-associated presenilin-1 c.548G>T mutation causes decreased mRNA expression and reduced presenilin function in knock-in mice. J Neurosci 32(15):5085–5096.
- 11 Heilig EA, Xia W, Shen J, Kelleher RJ, 3rd (2010) A presenilin-1 mutation identified in familial Alzheimer disease with cotton wool plaques causes a nearly complete loss of gamma-secretase activity. J Biol Chem 285(29):22350–22359.
- 12 Heilig EA, Gutti U, Tai T, Shen J, Kelleher RJ, 3rd (2013) Trans-dominant negative effects of pathogenic PSEN1 mutations on γ-secretase activity and Aβ production. J Neurosci 33(28):11606–11617.
- 13 Xia D, et al. (2015) Presenilin-1 knockin mice reveal loss-of-function mechanism for familial Alzheimer's disease. Neuron 85(5):967–981.
- 14 Xia D, Kelleher RJ, 3rd, Shen J (2016) Loss of Aβ43 production caused by presenilin-1 mutations in the knockin mouse brain. Neuron 90(2):417-422.
- **15** Bai XC, et al. (2015) An atomic structure of human  $\gamma$ -secretase. Nature 525(7568):212–217.
- 16 Pastor P, et al. (2003) Apolipoprotein Eepsilon4 modifies Alzheimer's disease onset in an E280A PS1 kindred. Ann Neurol 54(2):163–169.
- 17 Vélez JI, et al. (2016) APOE\*E2 allele delays age of onset in PSEN1 E280A Alzheimer's disease. Mol Psychiatry 21(7):916–924.
- 18 Ryman DC, et al.; Dominantly Inherited Alzheimer Network (2014) Symptom onset in autosomal dominant Alzheimer disease: A systematic review and metaanalysis. *Neurology* 83(3):253–260.
- 19 Wolfe MS (2007) When loss is gain: Reduced presenilin proteolytic function leads to increased Aβ42/Aβ40. Talking Point on the role of presenilin mutations in Alzheimer disease. *EMBO Rep* 8(2):136–140.
- 20 Zheng J, et al. (2012) Conditional deletion of Notch1 and Notch2 genes in excitatory neurons of postnatal forebrain does not cause neurodegeneration or reduction of Notch mRNAs and proteins. J Biol Chem 287(24):20356–20368.

DNAS Nd